

Negotiating Win-Win Solutions

This modelling the tools is incorporated into critical challenges at grade 10, however, it can be adapted for use at all grade levels.

Overview

In these activities students learn to negotiate a plan for developing a region of the Brazilian rain forest. Students are introduced to a situation that represents the impact of various actions on the interests of the five stakeholder groups. They learn to recognize solutions that are based on a win-win philosophy. As representatives of an assigned stakeholder group, students develop draft proposals for developing the rain forest area. Then, anticipating the responses of other stakeholder groups, students plan how they might accommodate these concerns. Students then meet with representatives of other stakeholder groups to reach consensus on a win-win solution. After all plans have been shared, students assess the impact of each proposal on various stakeholder groups. Finally, students write a position paragraph identifying and justifying their chosen development plan. In the debriefing, students consider the effectiveness of a win-win approach and whether solutions can be found to the problems facing the Brazilian rain forest.

Preplanning

Make arrangements for the symposium.

- In Session Two, students are invited to a mock symposium on issues facing the Brazilian rain forest where five guests, each representing a different stakeholder group, will address small groups of students. We suggest asking teachers, parents or high school drama students several weeks prior to this critical challenge to prepare for the following roles:
 - Angela Carr, environmentalist
 - Maria Sanchez, Brazilian peasant
 - Eduardo Rodrigues, Brazilian government official
 - Matuwe, Indigenous person
 - T. J. Edwards, multinational company executive.

Distribute the corresponding briefing sheets to each actor, who is to present the script in role at the symposium. Encourage the actors to present their talk dramatically and, if possible, to dress for the part. Arrange for the symposium to be held in the library or other large room where the guest speakers can each address approximately six student reporters.

Make arrangements for dramatization.

- In Session Three, we propose a short demonstration to dramatize win-win solutions. Prior to this class, identify and brief two groups of three students on the following situation:

The school just received new sports equipment. All of the grades want to use the equipment at break and lunchtime. Before she makes up her own mind, the principal has asked representatives from various grades to discuss what should be done.

Assign the following roles to the three students in each group:

- a young student who thinks that his/her grade should be allowed to use the equipment because they are the youngest and always lose out to the other grades
- a middle grade student who thinks his/her grade should be allowed to use the equipment because there are more students in his/her grade in the school than in any other grade
- a senior grade student who thinks his/her grade should be allowed to use the equipment more often because they have only one year left at the school

In the first dramatization, students are to focus on why their grade should get exclusive use of the equipment. Each is to show no knowledge or concern for how the other students might feel. They should refuse to agree on a solution other than the one they have suggested. In the second dramatization, the group is to work to find a solution that is fair to everyone. Encourage students to take turns listening to each other and to suggest different ways of sharing the equipment so that everyone benefits; e.g., getting grade levels to play together, staggering break and lunch times, collecting money so each grade would have its own equipment. Each role-play should take approximately three minutes. If the actors would benefit from your involvement, assume the role of principal in both scenarios.

Session One

Introduce symposium.

- Announce to the class that five guests, each representing a different stakeholder group, will speak the next day at a mock symposium on the Brazilian rain forest. In preparation for sending student representatives to hear each of these speakers, organize the five-person teams. Ensure that each team will have a representative at each presentation. If the class is not evenly divisible by five, add a sixth member to some teams. In these cases, teams will send two representatives to one of the visitor's presentations.
- Introduce note-taking task.

Inform students that they will be part of a press conference a day or two after the symposium to publicize the views of each stakeholder group. Explain to students that they must take detailed notes during the symposium to prepare their team for negotiations. Distribute a copy of [Notes on Stakeholder Perspective](#) to each student. Review the four kinds of summary information they are to record on this sheet:

- background information on the speaker and the stakeholder group he or she represents
- a list of the priority interests and concerns of this group
- proposed strategies or plans that the group would like implemented
- a record of the significant reasons and evidence supporting their proposals.

You may also want to suggest criteria for effective notes; e.g., focus on key ideas, record ideas in point form. Reassure students that they will receive a copy of the presenter's speech in case they cannot record all of the key information in note form at the time of the presentation.

Session Two

Hold symposium.

- On the day of the symposium, direct students to the previously arranged location such as the library. Assume the role of symposium organizer by taking on the following duties:
 - welcome the participants as they arrive
 - introduce each guest speaker
 - provide an overview and purpose of the symposium
 - remind students that copies of the speeches will be distributed after the presentations
 - encourage participants to ask questions of the guest speaker after the talk
 - direct participants to the location of the break-out sessions
 - thank the guests at the end of the symposium.

Review presentation notes.

- At the end of the symposium, distribute to each students a copy of the script of the guest speaker whose session he or she attended:

[Environmental Representative](#) (Background Information)

[Brazilian Peasant](#) (Background Information)

[Brazilian Government Official](#) (Background Information)

[Spokesperson for Indigenous Group](#) (Background Information)

[Multinational Company Executive](#) (Background Information).

Ask students to review their notes and read over the speech. Encourage students to use the script to supplement any missing information on [Notes on Stakeholder Perspective](#).

Session Three

Identify stakeholders' interests.

- As a way of preparing students to negotiate solutions to the issues facing the rain forest, invite them to represent, graphically, the various stakeholders' interrelated interests. Create five labelled circles on the board using [Web of Interests](#) as a template. If you want students to develop their own web with a partner, distribute an enlarged copy (11" x 17") of this web to each pair of students. Refer students to the press releases from the previous challenge to help them recall each stakeholder group's interests. Record the interests in keywords around the outside of the relevant stakeholder circle. It should

become obvious that shareholders share overlapping interests; e.g., money, preservation of forests.

Web impact of actions.

- Next, focus students' attention on each stakeholder's plans—what the group has done, is currently doing or proposes to do—and the anticipated impact of these actions on the other stakeholders. Here again, the press releases are a source of each stakeholder group's plans; e.g., ban all logging, turn land into reserves, sell land to environmentalists. Create a web by drawing lines from the stakeholder recommending a particular action to all the other groups' interests that will be affected by this proposal. An action that adversely affects another group's interests should be represented with a red or a thick line; an action that positively affects another group's interests should be represented with a blue or a dotted line. Label each line with a few words to indicate the action it represents; e.g., ban logging. For example, the Brazilian government's proposed plan to increase natural resource development in order to pay its international debt might be represented as follows:
 - a blue or dotted line from Government to Peasants (jobs) because resource development leads to more jobs for poor Brazilians
 - a blue or dotted line from Government to Multinational Companies (money) because resource development leads to greater profits for international companies
 - a red or thick line from Government to Peasants (social security) because use of the money to pay down the debt has hampered Brazil's ability to provide social services
 - red or thick lines from Government to Indigenous Peoples and Environmentalists (preservation of the forest) because large scale development has led to damage to the rain forest.

Debrief the web.

- After a number of the proposed actions have been connected to the interests they impact, invite students to comment on the emergent web of interests. Draw out the interrelation of interests and the seemingly offsetting disadvantages for each action.

Introduce win-win solutions.

- Introduce a win-win habit of mind by inviting the two prearranged groups of students to dramatize the discussion about the use of the new sports equipment. Begin with the group that is focused exclusively on its own interests. After both groups have presented, discuss with the class the differences between the two role-plays. Point out, as illustrated by the first dramatization, that people often focus exclusively on their own interests. The goal usually is to win. Point out how everyone is a winner in the second role-play. Indicate that Steven Covey, author of *The Seven Habits of Highly Effective People*, uses the term "think win-win" to describe a mindset that looks for solutions where everyone gains. Write the term "win-win" on the board and explain three obstacles to thinking win-win:
 - people focus only on their own interests

- people do not understand other people's positions
- people believe that they necessarily lose something if other people gain anything.

Illustrate the merits of adopting a win-win mindset by contrasting the two dramatizations and discussing the benefits of the second group's solutions; e.g., getting grade levels to play together, staggering recess and lunch times, collecting money so each grade would have its own equipment. Indicate that students will soon be asked to develop win-win solutions to problems involving the Brazilian rain forest.

Session Four

Explain the role-play.

- Display an overhead transparency or distribute a copy of [Develop a Plan](#) to each student. Read aloud the scenario where students are to represent five stakeholder groups trying to negotiate a development plan for an area of the Brazilian rain forest. Explain the three phases of the role-play:
 - develop with other representatives from own stakeholder group two proposals for improving the conditions in the rain forest region
 - negotiate with representatives from the four other stakeholder groups a common plan that will be presented to the class
 - individually decide on the best (win-win) plan for the rain forest area.
- Explain that students will role-play the stakeholder group they represented at the press conference in the previous challenge. Point out that the goal is to reach a settlement on the use of the rain forest that provides the best solution for all involved. Remind students they should "think win-win" in order to reach this decision.

Explain self-evaluation of role-play.

- Before students join with their stakeholder groups, explain that they will be asked to self-evaluate their performance at the planning and the negotiating meetings. Place a transparency of [Self-evaluation](#) on the overhead. Review the five questions and the format for rating the performance during the role-play. Remind students to stay in the role assigned to them and to represent the interests of their stakeholder group when offering comments and agreeing to proposed solutions.

Introduce the first critical task.

- Organize students into the stakeholder groups they represented at the press conference and present the following critical task:

Propose a plan for your assigned stakeholder group and engage in a role-play to negotiate with other groups.

Distribute a copy of [Initial Planning](#) chart to each stakeholder group. Within their stakeholder groups, students are to discuss possible proposals for developing the region that their stakeholder

group could support, but that would also serve other groups' interests. Each group is to record, on the chart, possible solutions and the advantages to themselves and to other groups. Remind students that they will individually represent their stakeholder group at the negotiation meetings so they must understand and be able to present and defend their group's proposals in a convincing and informed manner.

Discuss criteria for initial proposal.

Before students decide on the two proposals their group will bring to the negotiations, discuss with the class the following criteria:

- the proposals should meet their own group's interests
- the proposals' implications for other groups must be clearly understood
- the proposals must accommodate, to some extent, other groups' interests.

Decide on two proposals.

- After each group has selected two proposals, distribute a copy of [Implications of Proposals](#) to each student. In completing this sheet, students are to work with their group members to identify how other stakeholder groups might be affected by their proposals. Encourage students to review the press releases from the other groups for more information on their interests and positions. Students should also consult the class- or student-generated [Web of Interests](#). Each student should record possible modifications that might make the proposed actions more accommodating of other stakeholder interests. Explain that you will randomly assess only one [Implications of Proposals](#) sheet from each group to use as the basis for the group mark, so all students must fully complete all sections.

Session Five

Option: Introduce possible options.

- If students have proposed a weak or limited set of solutions, distribute [Possible Options](#). Ask students to work in stakeholder groups to discuss these options. Encourage students to make notes on the anticipated effects of the options on each stakeholder group listed. In a class discussion, invite students to comment on whether or not each option offers a win-win solution for all stakeholders.

Organize negotiating groups.

- Organize students into negotiating groups composed of one representative from each stakeholder group. For simplicity, use the documentary production teams to compose the different negotiating groups. Distribute a copy of [Notes on Suggested Plans](#) to each student who is to record, in note form, the substance of each proposal, the advantages and disadvantages, and any probing questions that come to mind. Explain that each representative will have three minutes to present his or her group's two suggestions and

the reasons why other groups should accept these proposals. During each presentation, other students are to complete the relevant sections of [Notes on Suggested Plans](#). Representatives may ask probing questions but are not to debate or disagree with the proposal until all proposals have been presented.

Explain negotiating procedures.

- Explain to students that after presenting their proposals, the negotiating groups will work to reach consensus on two proposals for use of the rain forest. Ask students to define what it means to reach consensus (general agreement on an option). Point out that this is not a vote where the majority decides but an agreement among all parties. A decision is not reached until everyone agrees with it. If a consensus is difficult to reach, group members need to discuss further the ways in which they can compromise. To help them reach consensus, they may find it helpful to adopt the following guidelines for a respectful discussion:
 - speak in turn—do not interrupt
 - restate others' points for clarification
 - disagree in a respectful way—disagree with the point not the person.

Remind students that they are to adopt a win-win attitude in developing a plan that best meets everyone's interests. The objective of win-win is that each stakeholder group fulfills its interests while promoting the interests of other groups. This mindset requires the following:

- trying to understand the other groups' positions
- considering the other groups' interests as well as their own
- trusting that it is possible for all groups to meet many of their goals, although there may be some give and take.

Develop criteria for win-win solutions.

- Before beginning to negotiate their plans, remind students of the following criteria for a win-win solution:
 - is feasible
 - promotes everyone's (or almost everyone's) interests
 - is fair to everyone concerned.

Record these criteria on chart paper or an overhead transparency for reference.

Hold the negotiation meetings.

- Invite students to discuss the proposals only after all the presentations are made. In their groups, students are to discuss the benefits and disadvantages of each proposal and try to reach consensus on two actions that will best serve all groups' interests. Remind students to keep in mind the criteria for a win-win solution and that they may need to compromise. Refer students to the possible modifications to their proposals that they identified on [Implications of Proposals](#). After a plan is reached that is agreeable to everyone, each

group should record its two proposals and the reasons on chart paper for sharing with the rest of the class.

Session Six

Present plans and listen to all proposals.

- Distribute two copies of [Impact of Proposals](#) to each student. Explain that, as each negotiating group makes its presentation, students are to record the suggested plans, indicate their impact on each stakeholder group's interests and offer comments on the main strengths and weaknesses of each proposal. Call upon two representatives from each group to present their proposals to the class. Remind students to provide reasons and explain how their proposal provides a win-win solution for each stakeholder group. Encourage students to ask the presenters for clarification, if necessary. After all the presentations, invite the class to discuss the degree to which each plan meets various stakeholders' interests.

Introduce second critical task.

- After a suitable amount of class discussion, inform students that they are to address the second critical task:

Determine the best plan for improving conditions in the rain forest area.

Based on the discussions, ask students to put aside their assigned role and individually decide which plan (it may include several specific courses of action) offers the best win-win solution. In a position paragraph, each student is to explain why the proposed solution best serves all stakeholder groups. Reiterate that in making this judgement they should consider the criteria discussed earlier;

e.g., is feasible, promotes all groups' interests, is fair to everyone. Point out that it may be difficult to promote everyone's interests equally, but they should look for the plan that most closely meets this criterion or propose modifications that will better serve everyone's interests.

Debrief the role-play.

- After students have determined the best plan, invite them to share their solution with a partner, in small groups or as a class. Ask students to consider whether or not one plan can solve the problems facing the Brazilian rain forest. Also discuss the process used to reach a win-win solution. Distribute a copy of [Self-evaluation](#) to each student to use in assessing his or her personal contributions during the role-play. After completing their self-evaluation, instruct students to meet with their documentary teams to discuss the following questions:

What problems did stakeholders face in reaching consensus?
What strategies helped them work through the difficulties?
Was their group's decision a win-win solution? Why or why not?

Assessment

Assess initial plans.

- Assess students' suggested plan and anticipated impact as recorded on [Initial Planning](#) and [Implications of Proposals](#) using the rubric [Assessing Initial Plans](#). According to this rubric, the assignment is assessed on three criteria:
 - recognizes benefits to own group
 - recognizes impact on other groups
 - accommodates other groups' interests.

Assess self-evaluation.

- You may wish to assess students' self-evaluation of their role-play performance as recorded on [Self-evaluation](#) using the rubric [Assessing Role-play Performance](#). According to this rubric, the assignment is assessed on two criteria:
 - self-assessed performances
 - justification for self-assessments.

Assess justification of solution.

- Assess students' identification of effects and justification of their solution as recorded on [Impact of Proposals](#) and in their position paragraph using the rubric [Assessing Impact and Decision](#). According to this rubric, the assignment is assessed on three criteria:
 - accurate assessment of impact
 - identification of strengths and weaknesses
 - justification for solution.








Credits

Adapted from Don Northey, Jan Nicol and Roland Case, eds., *Brazilian Rain Forest* (Vancouver, BC: The Critical Thinking Consortium, 2002). Permission granted by The Critical Thinking Consortium for use by Alberta teachers.




Documents

The following documents are referenced in the above modelling the tools.
They can be adapted for your needs and re-saved.

Graphic Organizers

- [Notes on Stakeholder Perspective](#) 
- [Initial Planning](#) 
- [Implications of Proposals](#) 
- [Impact of Proposals](#) 
- [Notes on Suggested Plans](#) 
- [Self-evaluation](#) 
- [Web of Interests](#) 

Assessment

- [Assessing Initial Plans](#) 
- [Assessing Role-play Performance](#) 
- [Assessing Impact and Decision](#) 

Lesson Material

- [Develop a Plan](#) 
- [Possible Options](#) 

Background Information

- [Environmental Representative](#) 
- [Brazilian Peasant](#) 
- [Brazilian Government Official](#) 
- [Spokesperson for Indigenous Group](#) 
- [Multinational Company Executive](#) 